

**Investigating a Learning Design for Collaborative Authoring of
Multimodal Texts for its Efficacy to Support Student Learning:
A Case Study Based in an English as a Second Language (ESL)
Classroom in Hong Kong**

by Lata Jayaprakash

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of

Doctor of Education

under the supervision of Associate Professor Matthew Kearney

University of Technology Sydney
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

August 2020

Certificate of Original Authorship

I, Lata Jayaprakash, declare that this thesis is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of degree of Doctor of Education, in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

	Production Note:
Signature:	Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 31 August 2020

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I wish to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Associate Professor Matthew Kearney, for his enduring patience and unswerving guidance over the extended period of my study. His staunch support and dedication during the setbacks over the years were truly reassuring and much appreciated. I could not have hoped for better guidance than he has provided and I thank him for being that “critical friend” he has always been. I would like to thank my secondary supervisor Dr Damian Maher for his valuable feedback and support. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to my course coordinator, Associate Professor Liam Morgan, for his advice and guidance throughout my study. His insights in this field have deepened my knowledge.

A big thank you to my husband, Jayan for being a pillar of strength during the most trying times of my doctoral journey. His sense of humour and unwavering patience kept me going relentlessly. I am also grateful to my son Kiran for being there for me, wholeheartedly supporting my passion and for critiquing my developing thesis from afar, almost always at short notice.

I am extremely grateful to the Principal at my research site for giving me the opportunity to conduct this research. I thank the teacher-participant immensely for her ongoing support and insightful comments and suggestions over the period. My deepest appreciation goes to all the student participants whose commitment to this project was critical in bringing this research study to fruition.

I take this opportunity to acknowledge the editorial assistance of accredited editor Dr Terry Fitzgerald, whose academic field is education, for his timely professional service and advice.

Most importantly, I thank my parents for their love, encouragement and wholehearted support in all my creative endeavours. They have been a source of inspiration throughout my life.

Abstract

Over the past two decades, major shifts in the information and communication landscape have brought about a change in the everyday literacy practices of the 21st century learner, necessitating a change in the provision of language and literacy education in schools. While pen and paper is still the norm in the English language writing classrooms in Hong Kong, students are now able to use multimedia technologies to support learning and express themselves in new and creative ways. Making these powerful knowledge creation tools integral to the literacy classroom may open doors to new emancipatory ways of learning in the Hong Kong context. Guiding learners along this new learning trajectory involves transforming pedagogical practices, including use of contemporary learning spaces. Learning designs can help address this challenge and offer best-practice strategies and guidelines for contemporary technology-enhanced learning. However, facilitating this transition without a clear road map poses a challenge to educators and researchers, given the limited number of learning designs available in this area to guide practice.

This thesis reports on the findings from a study investigating a learning design for collaborative authoring of multimodal texts for its efficacy to support student learning in an English as a second language (ESL) classroom in Hong Kong. An interpretive case study was adopted for the investigation that lasted two years including the trial. The case was a class of 22 Form 4 students, including boys and girls, who were 15 years of age at the start of the study, and their teacher. Data sources include the researcher's observation notes supported by screen recordings and videos; student participants' reflective journals, focus groups and knowledge artefacts; and the teacher participant's reflective journals, stimulated recall interview and learning design evaluation. Findings indicate that the use of the learning design fostered learner autonomy and amplified real-world relevance for students, mediated their problem-solving processes and scaffolded their multimodal literacy development.

Keywords: learning design, multimodal literacy, multimodal texts, 21st century learning, technology-enhanced learning, language and literacy education, content and language integrated learning (CLIL)

Table of Contents

Title Page		
Certificate of Original Authorship		ii
Acknowledgements		iii
Abstract		iv
Table of Contents		v
List of Figures		ix
List of Tables		xi
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
	Overview	1
	1.1 Background to the Study	2
	1.2 The Research Question for this Study	4
	1.3 Research Design	5
	1.4 The Design and Development of MELD	6
	1.5 Significance of the Study	9
	1.6 Limitations	10
	1.7 Overview of Thesis	11
	1.8 Conclusion	12
Chapter 2	Review of Literature	13
	Overview	13
	2.1 Introduction	13
	2.2 Sociocultural Theory and Learning and Development	14
	2.3 Sociocultural Theory and Language and Literacy Education	19
	2.4 Background Context	25

	2.5 Reconfiguring Educational Design to Foster Knowledge Creation	29
	2.6 Contemporary Transformative Pedagogical Models	33
	2.7 Reframing Pedagogical Goals with a New Learning Design	39
	2.8 Conclusion	46
Chapter 3	Development of the Multimodal Exploratory Learning Design (MELD) Used in this Study	48
	Overview	48
	3.1 Introduction	48
	3.2 Background on Learning Design	49
	3.3 Sociocultural Theory and the Development of MELD	50
	3.4 Theory of Multimodality and the Development of MELD	53
	3.5 Developing Representations of MELD	58
	3.6 The Enactment of MELD	70
	3.7 Conclusion	73
Chapter 4	Research Methodology	75
	Overview	75
	4.1 Introduction to the Study	75
	4.2 Research Design	79
	4.3 Procedures	82
	4.4 Data Collection	88
	4.5 Data Analysis	93
	4.6 Trustworthiness and Validity	95
	4.7 Limitations	97
	4.8 Ethical Considerations	99
	4.9 Conclusion	100

Chapter 5	Findings	101
	Overview	101
5.1	The Use of MELD Fostered Student Empowerment, Agency and Ownership	103
5.2	The Use of MELD Amplified Real-World Relevance to Students	110
5.3	The Use of MELD Mediated Students' Collaborative Problem-Solving Processes	117
5.4	The Use of MELD Scaffolded the Development of Students' Multimodal Literacy	128
5.5	Conclusion	163
Chapter 6	Discussion and Conclusion	165
	Overview	165
6.1	Introduction	165
6.2	Summary and Significance of Findings	167
6.3	Contribution to the Field of Learning Design	173
6.4	Implications for Stakeholders	185
6.5	Limitations	192
6.6	Future Research Directions	194
6.7	Conclusion	197
Appendices		198
Appendix A	Extracts from the Needs Analysis Survey Results	198
Appendix B	Protocol for Student Reflective Journal – End of Trial	199
	Protocol for Student Reflective Journal – End of Stage 1	201
	Protocol for Student Reflective Journal – End of Stage 2	202
	Protocol for Teacher Reflective Journal – End of Trial	203

Appendix C	Protocol for Teacher Reflective Journal – End of Stage 2	204
	Protocol for Stimulated Recall – Teacher-Participant	205
	Learning Design Evaluation by the Teacher-Participant	206
Appendix D	Protocol for Focus Group Semi-Structured Interview	209
Appendix E	Permission to Conduct the Study in the Research Site Granted by the School Principal	210
Appendix F	Copy of the Consent Form Sent to the Student Participants’ Parents or Guardians	211
	Chinese Version of the Consent Form Sent to the Student Participants’ Parents or Guardians	212
Appendix G	MELD and its Link to the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education (HKDSE) English Language Curriculum and Social Issues	213
Appendix H	MELD and its Link to Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education (HKDSE) and Other Learning Experiences	214
Appendix I	Examples of Collaborative Writing	215
References		216

List of Figures

Figure 3. 1	Sociocultural theory and the three precepts informing the design of MELD and the use of learning spaces.	51
Figure 3. 2	Conceptual framework of MELD devised for this study	55
Figure 3. 3	Constituent elements of online learning settings (Oliver & Herrington, 2001, p. 20)	58
Figure 3. 4	The MELD Representation System using the LDRS (Oliver & Herrington, 2001), giving details of the fundamental elements	60
Figure 3. 5	The MELD visual sequence used in this study (adapted from the LDVS representation of Agostinho et al., 2008)	63
Figure 3. 6	The ten tasks in MELD	66
Figure 4. 1	Redesigned authoring environment of the school room and the collaborative multimodal technologies accessible on the network	84
Figure 4. 2	Redesign of learning spaces for the enactment of this study	85
Figure 4. 3	Redesigned classroom where the study was conducted	85
Figure 5. 1	Groups exercising autonomy as they brainstorm and plan their linguistic texts	103
Figure 5. 2	Graphical representations and reports prepared by Group 3 and Group 2	118
Figure 5. 3	Evolution of Group 1 students' mind map used for problem-solving	121
Figure 5. 4	Artefacts from Group 4, illustrating their problem-solving process	123
Figure 5. 5	Group 6 students' problem-solution fishbone diagram	124
Figure 5. 6	Fishbone diagram outlining the problems Group 2 faced in completing their activity and the solutions they came up with	125
Figure 5. 7	Group 2 students' revised fishbone diagram identifying problems and solutions related to the topic of their choice	126
Figure 5. 8	Screenshot of a web page highlighted by Group 1, showing students' developing content knowledge	129
Figure 5. 9	Screenshots of Group 5 students' digital content curation	130
Figure 5. 10	Diigo library showing references annotated and tagged by Group 2 students	131

Figure 5. 11	Group 5 students' data visualisation of personal carbon footprint by country	134
Figure 5. 12	A screenshot of Group 6 creating a bar chart showing the social issue of uneven distribution of oil reserves by country	135
Figure 5. 13	Infographics of e-waste concentration by Group 4, and crude oil deposits by Group 6	135
Figure 5. 14	Group 5 students' mind map showing analysis of the social issue of carbon footprint	136
Figure 5. 15	Fishbone diagram created by Group 3, showing their visual representation of content knowledge about green buildings as a solution	138
Figure 5. 16	Graphical report by Group 6 and feedback from the teacher	142
Figure 5. 17	Group 6 students' mind map showing analysis of a social issue with annotated feedback from the teacher	143
Figure 5. 18	Group 6 students' revised mind map showing analysis of a social issue after addressing issues raised by the teacher	144
Figure 5. 19	Group 6 students' work with teacher feedback in collapsed comment bubbles	145
Figure 5. 20	Group 6 students' revised diagram after teacher feedback	146
Figure 5. 21	Group 4 blending content and language to produce a draft of the essay	146
Figure 5. 22	Group 6 editing their essay in Google Doc with the help of Grammarly check feedback	147
Figure 5. 23	Group 2 students' revision of their essay in Google Doc, after feedback	149
Figure 5. 24	Introductory movie created by Group 6 (Source: screenshot from their unpublished iBook)	153
Figure 5. 25	Examples of interactive widgets and review features created by different groups using functionalities of the authoring program	157
Figure 5. 26	iBook pages with embedded multimodal elements by Group 2	159
Figure 5. 27	iBook pages with embedded multimodal elements by Group 6	161
Figure 6. 1	Efficacy of MELD and the four themes emerging from this study	167
Figure 6. 2	The Multimodal Exploratory Learning Design (MELD) Framework emerging from this study	175

Figure 6. 3	Staging of MELD during the three phases of multimodal authoring	176
Figure 6. 4	The emergent MELD taxonomy for the authoring of text-centric multimodal genres	177
Figure 6. 5	The model of project-level integration of MELD into secondary education developed in this study	178
Figure 6. 6	Resources and supports embedded in MELD: Granularity map of MELD developed in this study and examples of each category for one of the tasks (problematising) in the multimodal authoring workflow	179
Figure 6. 7	The MELD planning guide emerging from this study	180
Figure 6. 8	Representation of the three constituent elements of MELD using the learning design representation system from Oliver and Herrington (2001)	181

List of Tables

Table 3. 1	A typology for MELD	64
Table 3. 2	The MELD road map for students	69
Table 3. 3	Characteristics of MELD framework	72
Table 4. 1	Philosophical assumptions with implications for this study (Adapted from Creswell, 2013)	76
Table 4. 2	Interpretive framework and associated philosophical beliefs in this study (Adapted from Lincoln et al., 2011)	77
Table 4. 3	Student participants in the study (anglophone pseudonyms are used)	80
Table 4. 4	Timeline for the enactments of MELD during the study	86
Table 4. 5	Stages of data collection and methods	89
Table 5. 1	The four themes that emerged and data sources used for triangulation	102
Table 5. 2	Students' choice of problems as topics for the two authoring projects	104
Table 5. 3	Reminder of the multimodal authoring workflow (from Chapter 3) and the corresponding feedback points in the learning design	139

Table 5. 4	Modes of representation the groups created for their iBook	158
Table 6. 1	A typology for MELD, using categories from Oliver et al. (2002)	182